

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA



**MILLENNIUM PROJECT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
FIVE-YEAR REPORT – FALL 2006**

**MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006**

**THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA
MILLENNIUM PROJECT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
FIVE-YEAR REPORT – FALL 2006**

Introduction

The Millennium Project Oversight Committee (MROC) is an outgrowth of the first phase of the Millennium Project, a landmark University-wide study commissioned by former President Peter Likins in 2000 to explore the work life of women faculty and faculty of color and, more importantly, to identify ways to rectify inequities.* The first step identified in project report was to “. . . appoint a Millennium Project Oversight Committee to work with the President’s Cabinet to monitor the implementation of the Action Agenda for a New Millennium” (Cress, Dinnerstein, Miller, & Hart, 2001, p. 2). In late 2001, President Likins in conjunction with the Project’s directors, tapped faculty leaders throughout the University to be members of the Millennium Report Oversight Committee (MROC).

The report’s Action Agenda also called for a two-year evaluation and a five-year evaluation of the University’s progress in achieving the goals of the Millennium Report. The two-year interim evaluation took place in 2003. This paper reports the progress over the past five years in overcoming the inequities experienced by underrepresented UA faculty as noted in the Millennium Report.

* The second phase of the Millennium Project concentrated on work life of classified staff and appointed personnel.

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

The Millennium Project (Phase One)

Background: The president, the provost, vice-presidents, and deans provided funding for the first phase of the Millennium Project, which was sponsored by the UA Commission on the Status of Women (CSW) and the Association of Women Faculty (AWF). The project hired a director from outside the institution to ensure objectivity and was guided by a steering committee, campus advisory board, community advisory board, and national advisory board.

Project Methodology: The UA Office of Decision and Planning Support (DAPS) and the 1998-99 national survey by the Higher Education Research Institute at University of California Los Angeles (837 UA faculty respondents) provided numerical data on gender/race distribution of faculty and administrators, workload, salary, and perspectives on working conditions. With these survey results as background, individual interviews and focus groups were conducted on campus. Open-ended questionnaires were used to provide more detailed information.

There were 273 individuals interviewed; 165 faculty members were randomly selected and an additional 109 participated as members of organized administrative or discussion groups (e.g., Women in Science and Engineering, Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender Studies, etc.). The participants represented all 15 of the University's colleges and professional schools and over 80 departments and offices. The participants included 214 women, 59 men, 175 white non-Hispanics, and 55 people of color.

Project Findings: The study established that "large numbers of female faculty and faculty of color experience a particularly challenging and sometimes hostile campus climate." (Cress, Dinnerstein, Miller, & Hart, p. 1)* Furthermore, researchers pointed to a lack of data and of accountability as barriers to changing climate and improving disparate working conditions of faculty.

When compared to public universities in a national survey, UA faculty are less likely to believe that 1) hiring more women faculty and administrators is an

* The Millennium Report defines campus climate as ". . . the current perceptions, attitudes, and expectations that define the institution and its members." (Cress, 2001, p.4)

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT

FALL 2006

institutional priority and that 2) creating a multicultural environment is an institutional priority (Millennium Project Summary Report).

Project Recommendations: Four groups of recommendations were presented in the Millennium Report: The first group addresses “Implementing the Agenda” and the other three deal with creating “Diverse,” “Fair,” and “Hospitable” communities.

MROC’s Work

2001-2006

In the late fall of 2001, President Likins, in consultation with people who were intricately involved with the Millennium I project, appointed the first MROC members. MROC membership, drawn from faculty leaders throughout the University, quickly organized and named the following three task forces to work with the administration and campus leaders to monitor specific areas identified in the report:

- Fair Task Force – to develop strategies and activities to further the creation of a campus that is truly fair, including identifying and rectifying salary inequities
- Hospitable Task Force – to address climate issues, including subtle discrimination and harassment, and to foster quality mentoring in this academic community
- Diverse Task Force – to develop strategies and activities to increase numbers of women and faculty of color in UA leadership and tenure-track positions

MROC became a formidable organization. The leadership initiated regular meetings with the President and Provost to discuss issues, make recommendations, and get feedback from administration. MROC leaders and some of its members were also members of the Diversity Coalition, the group appointed by the President and charged with producing the UA Diversity Action Plan (DAP). Consequently, many of the Millennium I recommendations are included in the DAP action steps. Because the MROC members were active

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT

FALL 2006

faculty members and administrators deeply committed to diversity issues across campus, many were also members of other groups addressing similar issues, including the Commission on the Status of Women (CSW) and the Association of Women Faculty (AWF). Thus, the recommendations from the Millennium I project were infused in the work of other campus groups and organizations. While MROC members were often frustrated and disappointed at the lack of progress, they also celebrated many successes and point to the many challenges remaining.

Successes and Unfinished Work

The Millennium I recommendations were arranged in four task forces:

- Implementing the Action Agenda
- Creating a Diverse Community
- Creating a Fair Community
- Creating an Hospitable Community

Many of the recommendations have been addressed, some very successfully and others in part. Others remain unaccomplished. The chart in Appendix A contains complete information.

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT FALL 2006

This section of the report summarizes progress and challenges of each task force in overcoming inequities identified in the first phase of the Millennium study.

Progress on Oversight of Implementing the Action Agenda

The Millennium Project's first set of actions focused on creating a structure to oversee implementation of recommendations in the Report. The first recommendation, that MROC be appointed to work with the President's Cabinet, became a reality. The second recommendation called for a full time Project Coordinator to work with MROC and for a budget to support operations, but neither was ever fully attained although some budget and some assistance were provided. In 2002, a part-time coordinator was made available to MROC and later the Diversity Resource Office staff assisted MROC and its committees. The third recommendation for a full-time position to collect and analyze faculty data to assess and report working conditions of faculty has not been implemented and remains a frustration to the MROC members who have worked diligently to get this position in place.

Progress and Challenges to Creating a Diverse Community

Administration Accomplishments

- The Diverse Resource Office (DRO) was established in 2003 partially to support the efforts of MROC and the Millennium Project Action Committee (MPAC).
- The DRO led an effort to bring campus diversity organizations together to create one common set of reporting parameters for faculty and staff data to be shared with the campus on an annual basis. Recommended data parameters were submitted to the Provost's Office for consideration. The "Diversity Group Common Data Request" appears in Appendix B.
- One of the major accomplishments of the Office of Institutional Research and Evaluation's (OIRE) new website was the addition of a diversity

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT

FALL 2006

category. The Provost and Vice Provost for academic affairs wanted a unified site where the University community could access information about students and employees. Members of the UA's diversity organizations needed quick, reliable, access to the latest trend information. To that end, an integrated page was designed with links to the many campus offices having information on diversity. Key demographic trend tables showing progress on gender parity and the growth of a more diverse faculty, staff, and student body provide the University with quantitative measures that complement its efforts to enhance and nurture a diverse campus. The site also points to resources, initiatives, support centers, and committees devoted to serving the UA community. Visit: <http://oirps.arizona.edu/Diversity.asp>

- An exit survey has been created by Human Resources and implemented in the summer of 2006.

Diverse Task Force Accomplishments

**The lack of available data had a significant adverse impact on the work of each of the MROC task forces.*

- Collaborated with campus diversity groups to create one common data request that contained the variables that must be considered to effectively track the numbers of women faculty and faculty of color recruited and retained in each college.
- Investigated "cluster hiring" as a means to attract underrepresented faculty and facilitated a "Cluster Hires for Diversity Workshop," which resulted in the development of some cluster hiring plans across campus. Budget cuts prevented the implementation of these plans.
- Recommended strategies for offering awards to colleges for hiring and retaining tenure-track underrepresented faculty that were included in The Recruitment and Retention of a Diverse Faculty: A Proposal by the Deans' Diversity Subcommittee (Tatum, et al., 2002).
- Developed an approach for exit interviews, surveys, and also suggested use of pulse interviews to gather data as to why faculty are not retained.

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

Recommendations for Future Action

- Establish an annual reporting process to track the numbers of women faculty and faculty of color recruited and retained in each college with the trends being publicly announced to the campus annually. The data needed, but currently unavailable, is displayed in Appendix C.
- Implement exit and pulse interviews.
- Work with Provost and Faculty Senate and collaborate with other existing faculty groups to develop and implement networking programs to address the isolation of junior faculty and underrepresented faculty.
- It should be noted that many action steps from the Millennium study on faculty are included in the Diverse Task Force (DAP). However, some steps were either partially included or left out. The Diverse Task Force recommends adding the follow action steps to the Diversity Action Plan:
 - Establish an annual reporting process to track the numbers of women faculty and faculty of color recruited and retained in each college.
 - Offer substantive rewards to colleges that increase numbers of women faculty and faculty of color in tenure-track positions, through incentives such as receiving a new line from the Provost or other resources.
 - Make each college and its dean accountable for increasing the numbers of women faculty and faculty of color in leadership positions.
 - Initiate a “critical mass” program to support the hiring of tenure-track women faculty and faculty of color in departments that house an unusually small proportion of such faculty. (Note: This action step is partially in Faculty section of DAP, under Pipeline Development/Promotion & Tenure.)

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

- To address the relative isolation of faculty of color and junior faculty, establish a program that provides resources and support for networking groups of faculty of color, junior faculty, and other groups, akin to the University of Michigan's Women of Color in the Academy Project. (*Note: This action step is partially in Faculty section of DAP, Under Pipeline Development/Promotion & Tenure.*)

Progress and Challenges to Creating a Fair Community

Administration Accomplishments

- Development of guidelines for faculty salary equity adjustments by Vice Provost for Academic Affairs. Salary Equity Guidelines are displayed in Appendix E.
- The Colleges and the Provost have implemented methods to provide faculty with increased flexibility in pursuing tenure.
- Retention data for the 2004-05 academic year illustrate that underrepresented faculty were retained at the same pace as male majority faculty.

Fair Task Force Accomplishments

- Fair Task Force interviewed Ombuds office, CAFT, and Equal Opportunity and Affirmative Action Office, and found that the number of complaints and grievances per year is small and that University procedures are functioning well.
- Task Force Co-chairs participated in writing of successful NSF ADVANCE grant, incorporating several Fair Task Force action items related to monitoring of start up packages and salary equity.
- Fair Task Force Co-chair participated in project, *Agencies of Change: Faculty Leadership in Initiating and Sustaining Diversity at the University of*

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT

FALL 2006

Arizona (Hart, et al., 2005), funded by Rutgers University and the Ford Foundation. This report served as an interim review of MROC activities and compiled University wide statistics on faculty diversity.

- Task Force Co-chair appointed to serve on Provost's Blue Ribbon Committee on Faculty Work Life.

Recommendations for Future Action

- Inclusion of detailed information on salary and climate studies in college annual reports as a mechanism to monitor equity.
- Annualize salary equity review process.
- Ensure fair treatment of women and other underrepresented faculty through the Provost asking colleges to use a "second-look" mechanism for performance reviews and to report on the disaggregate outcomes in their annual reports.
- Blue Ribbon Committee on Faculty Worklife should pay attention to the additional workload for women and faculty of color.
- It should be noted that many action steps from the Millennium study on faculty are included in the Diversity Action Plan (DAP). However, some steps were either partially included or left out. The MROC Executive Team Co-Chairs recommend adding the follow action steps to the Diversity Action Plan:
 - Promote equity within the hiring process by providing a comprehensive list of negotiable items available as a part of start-up packages to department heads and deans. (Note: This step is partially in place in the Faculty section of DAP, under "Increase representation of women faculty and faculty of color in tenure-track positions and leadership roles." The Fair Task Force recommends it be added in its entirety.)
 - Publicize existing policies (e.g., alternative duties, sexual harassment, sick childcare, maternity leave) and ensure equitable enforcement and application in every department through

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT

FALL 2006

oversight and education. (Note: This step is partially in place on the Human Resources web page but the Fair Task Force recommends it be added to the DAP in its entirety.)

- Given the difficulty of achieving blind review through all performance review processes, develop a “second-look” review mechanism for women faculty and faculty of color to ensure fair treatment of individuals in these groups.
- Evaluate mechanisms for implementing a more flexible full-time/part-time or mixed part-time/full-time option to enable faculty to achieve their greatest potential by having the choice of a part-time or full-time path toward tenure that will accommodate a variety of work-life circumstances.

Progress and Challenges to Creating a Hospitable Community

Administration Accomplishments

- Accountability for diversity was integrated into the regular annual review process.
- Harassment training incorporates sexual harassment prevention as one its components; and covers all protected categories.
- Participation by University in the New Scholar’s Survey by Cathy Trower.

Hospitable Task Force Accomplishments

- Organized Subtle Discrimination Conference.
- Generated agreement with administration about exit interview and survey protocols.
- Collaborated with administration to educate campus leaders about white privilege.
- Wrote 2 bulletins on subtle discrimination that President Likins circulated.

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

Recommendations for Future Action

- Require supervisors to assess subtle discrimination with regard to employee performance and to take steps to improve campus climate related to this issue.
- Conduct pulse interviews of tenure-track and tenured faculty at key junctures in their career development and develop action plans based on both pulse and exit interviews.
- Facilitate Human Resources, Equal Opportunity and Affirmative Action, and Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure to engage in information sharing regarding discrimination and harassment sharing.
- It should be noted that many action steps from the Millennium study on faculty are included in the Diversity Action Plan (DAP). However, some steps were either partially included or left out. The Hospitable Task Force recommends adding the follow action step to the Diversity Action Plan:
 - Address impediments to respectful treatment of all members of the campus community (UA value statement).

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

References

Cress, C., Dinnerstein, M., Miller, N.J., Hart, J. (2001). The Millennium Project: Summary Report. Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona, Office of the President.

Cress, C. (2001). The Millennium Project: Report in Detail. Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona, Office of the President.

Tatum, et al. The Recruitment and Retention of a Diverse Faculty: A Proposal by the Deans' Diversity Subcommittee. (2002, August). Tucson, AZ: The University of Arizona.

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

MROC Task Force Members

Elizabeth Kennedy, Co-Chair
Professor, Women's Studies
Co-Chair Diverse Task Force

Jeanne Kleespie
Assistant Vice President
Equal Opportunity and Affirmative Action Office
Hospitable Task Force

Deborah Levine-Donnerstein
Senior Researcher, Dean of Students Office
Diverse Task Force

Toni Griego-Jones
Associate Professor, Teaching and Teacher Education
Co-Chair Diverse Task Force

Beth Mitchneck
Associate Dean, Academic Affairs,
Social and Behavioral Sciences
Co-Chair Hospitable Task Force

Barbara Mills
Professor, Anthropology
Co-Chair Fair Task Force

William McCallum
Professor, Mathematics
Co-Chair Fair Task Force

Patti Ota
Vice President, Enrollment Management
Hospitable Task Force

MROC FIVE-YEAR REPORT
FALL 2006

Kathryn Reed
Department Head, Obstetrics and Gynecology
Co-Chair Hospitable Task Force

Mary Jo Tippeconnic Fox
Associate Professor, American Indian Studies
Diverse Task Force